



**Asia-Pacific
Economic Cooperation**

2013/SOM1/CPLG/015

Agenda Item: 7

International Enforcement Cooperation in Civil Antitrust Investigations

Purpose: Information
Submitted by: United States



**Competition Policy and Law Group Meeting
Jakarta, Indonesia
3-4 February 2013**

**INTERNATIONAL ENFORCEMENT
COOPERATION IN CIVIL ANTITRUST
INVESTIGATIONS**

Dina Kallay
Counsel for I.P. & International Antitrust
Federal Trade Commission

APEC Competition Policy and Law Group
Jakarta, February 3-4, 2013

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Outline

- Civil antitrust investigations
- Benefits from agencies' cooperation
- When information exchanges matter
- Cooperation and confidentiality rules
- Waivers of confidentiality
- Cooperation – “How to”

2

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Outline (cont'd)

- Myths about enforcement cooperation
- U.S. bilateral agreements & international organizations

3

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Civil Antitrust Investigations

- The FTC's competition enforcement mission involves civil enforcement in merger and conduct investigations (unilateral conduct and concerted practices)
- The U.S. DOJ has sole jurisdiction over criminal antitrust enforcement
- This presentation focuses on cooperation in civil investigations

4

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Benefits from Cooperation

Direct Benefits

- Seeks to ensure complementarity and practicality of remedy obligations
- Can save agency resources and expedite the process (especially in non-merger cases)
- Analysis, especially by younger agencies, may benefit from such a dialogue

5

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Benefits from Cooperation

Indirect Benefits

Cooperation promotes convergence towards best practices (note also the ICN Steering Group Project on International Enforcement Cooperation, and OECD Competition Committee International Cooperation Project)

6

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Multi-jurisdictional investigations

- When different agencies investigate the same merger or conduct, exchanges can be helpful to coordinate:

- Timing
- Market definition
- Theories of competitive harm
- Remedies



7

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

When Information Exchanges Matter

Remedies that have cross-border effects:

- Merger divestitures that take place or have effects in another country (can only divest a unit to one buyer)
- Conduct remedies that will affect a company's behavior abroad
- Cooperation can also be helpful in cases that are ultimately closed

8

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Cooperation and confidentiality rules

- Confidentiality laws protect:
 - Materials obtained under compulsory/voluntary process
 - In the U.S., all pre-merger filing documents and the fact of the HSR filing (unless parties revealed it; or ET)
 - Trade secrets and confidential commercial information
§ 6(f) FTC Act
- Information submitted to the FTC in an investigation, is exempt from disclosure under FOIA § 21(f) of the FTC Act

9

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Cooperation and confidentiality rules

- Confidential treatment of parties' documents is crucial
- Cooperation instruments do not override confidentiality rules
- However, 2nd generation cooperation agreements, such as the U.S.-Australia Mutual Antitrust Enforcement Agreement do override confidentiality rules

10

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Public and Non-Confidential Information

- Some information must be kept confidential by law, but some may potentially be shared.
- In the United States:

CONFIDENTIAL

- Information obtained from firms or third parties
- Merger filings
- Proposed remedies

POTENTIALLY SHAREABLE

- Existence of investigation
- Agency theories about harm, markets, or remedies
- Industry studies and background

- **A lot can be accomplished without sharing confidential information**

11

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Waivers of Confidentiality

- In many cases, parties grant waivers of confidentiality to facilitate cooperation
 - More frequent when parties have incentives to cooperate (mergers), but not only
 - Parties decide whether to waive
 - No adverse consequences from declining to waive

12

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Waivers of Confidentiality (cont'd)

- ICN mergers Notifications and Procedures working group issued report with model waivers (FTC, DOJ, EC) and model waiver request text, available at:

<http://www.internationalcompetitionnetwork.org/uploads/library/doc330.pdf>

- A model waiver saves work for agency and parties
- Modifications to the model language can raise difficulties and delays
 - Time consuming to negotiate
 - Revisions that “roadmap” the agency’s case
 - Certain things an agency cannot commit to

13

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Cooperation – “How to”

- Ask the parties whether they filed the same transaction elsewhere in the world, or whether they are being investigated by another agency for similar conduct
- Follow the general and antitrust media for news of parallel investigations
- Call or email liaisons at counterpart competition agencies, to ask whether their agency has a similar pending investigation; professional networks are helpful

14

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Cooperation – “How to”

- Focus on jurisdictions where the proposed deal or conduct appears to have the most effects
- Staff-to-staff cooperation
- Effective cooperation on the basis of publicly available or non-confidential information
- Parties grant waivers of confidentiality

15

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Myths about Cooperation

Popular Myths

- Lack of a formal cooperation mechanism prevents effective cooperation
- Cooperation only takes place among developed countries

Reality

- Effective cooperation happens every day, with and without a formal mechanism
- Cooperation takes place whenever common enforcement interests call for it

16

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

U.S. Bilateral & Multilateral Instruments

- 9 Antitrust Cooperation Agreements



- 3 MoUs



- 1 Mutual Antitrust Enforcement Agreement



- OECD Recommendation on Cooperation between Member Countries – framework for cooperation with 34 jurisdictions



17

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

The benefits of bilateral agreements

- Provide a legal framework for cooperating
- For some agencies an agreement is a pre-requisite for speaking with other agencies
- An effective catalyst promoting a cooperative relationship

18

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Practicalities of Merger Cooperation

- 1. Identifying mergers with cross-border implications and the reviewing agencies as soon as possible.** E.g. parties or third parties identify voluntarily, sometimes on the pre-merger notification forms; media; contacting counterpart agency liaison officers; formal notifications under cooperation agreements
- 2. Seek the parties' cooperation.** In identifying other reviewing jurisdictions, and suggesting timing of filings in manner that maximizes opportunity for inter-agency coordination

19

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Practicalities of Merger Cooperation (cont'd)

- 3. Identify the affected product and geographic markets.** Staff may find it helpful to share their respective analyses, and learn from one another's prior expertise in an industry
- 4. Identify common enforcement interests,** so that cooperative efforts can be focused on overlapping enforcement interests
- 5. Seek waivers of confidentiality from the parties, as needed**

20

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION

Practicalities of Merger Cooperation (cont'd)

6. **Share substantive analyses.** Usually done orally, over the phone. FTC staff can often share its competitive analysis without a waiver, as long as it does not include any information supplied by the parties or third parties
7. **Identify and, to the extent permitted, share relevant evidence if helpful**
8. **Identify potential remedies, and coordinate the timeline.** In merger cases, the remedy is typically a divestiture. It is rare for settlement agreements to be reached simultaneously, but coordination is nonetheless extremely helpful

21

FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION